

BUDGET SUPPLEMENT NO: 6

May 23, 2006

SUBJECT: Alternatives for Street Sweeping Operations

BUDGET SUPPLEMENT REQUEST SUMMARY

For many years all City streets were swept every other week, but as part of the cost-saving service level reductions implemented in FY 2003/04, the frequency of street sweeping was reduced to once per month. This budget supplement considers options to modify the frequency of street sweeping. Three options are proposed (A, B and C) with varying cost increases depending upon the sweeping frequency. Alternative A (\$315,804 in annual cost increase) would return to the previous sweeping frequency of every-other-week. Alternative B (\$260,448 in annual cost increase) would increase street sweeping by approximately 50%, specifically during the winter (leaf drop and inclement weather time). Alternative C (\$246,252 in annual cost increase) would provide some savings by sweeping less frequently in the summer (i.e. no sweeping for 5 months), but returning sweeping during the fall and winter seasons (leaf-drop and inclement weather) to every-other-week. The street sweeping activities are part of the Pavement Operations Program 118 and funded by the General Fund.

The 20-year cost increase for each of the Alternatives is as follows:

- Alternative A: \$8,765,372 with inflation
- Alternative B: \$7,228,926 with inflation
- Alternative C: \$6,834,911 with inflation

BACKGROUND

The City of Sunnyvale has maintained the practice of sweeping streets every other week for many years, which was appreciated by residents who considered this a desirable quality-of-life service. Budget cuts implemented in FY 2003/04 forced the reduction in frequency to once a month in most residential neighborhoods. Nighttime sweeping of arterials (weekly), downtown (three times per week) and most of the industrial parts of town (weekly) were not changed.

In reducing this service, one sweeping machine and one position (Equipment Operator) were eliminated. Members of the public have expressed concern regarding the impact of this service level reduction when calling Field Services staff to inquire about sweeping schedules, or to complain about the changes. Impacts identified by the callers include accumulation of debris, decrease in appearance of neighborhoods, increase in pollutants entering waterways, difficulty remembering the schedule, and the severe impact if an area is not

swept for 2 full months due to a car parked on the street at sweeping time. Over two hundred calls of this nature have been received in the two years since the sweeping schedule was reduced.

Under the recommended budget for FY 2006/07, the City would continue to sweep streets at a once-a-month frequency

EXISTING POLICY

General Plan, Land Use and Transportation Element Goal C1: Preserve and enhance an attractive community, with a positive image and sense of place, that consists of distinctive neighborhoods, pockets of interest and human-scale development.

DISCUSSION

The FY 2006/07 program performance measure related to sweeping states: “Street sweeping requests/complaints are responded to within 2 working days from notification - 80% of the time.” This percentage was adopted in FY 2004/05 in response to the lower service levels allowed by the reduced budget, which eliminated one sweeping machine and one Equipment Operator position allocated to the Field Services Division.

A Matter of Perception

In general, the overall appearance of City streets is not significantly impacted by less sweeping during most of the year. Over four weeks there is a bit more dust, some leaves, some litter and other accumulation in the gutters, but nothing extreme. It is not as clean as in the past, but it is not such a change as to change the overall appearance of the City. This is validated by the nature of complaints received by staff, the majority of which have little to do with the actual cleanliness of the streets. The majority of complaints have to do with residents not seeing a sweeper on their street every two weeks (like they were used to), having to keep track of a schedule that is not as regular as it once was, and neighbors not moving their cars to clear the street on sweeping day. Many calls stem from the loss of “regularity” of knowing that the sweeper will be by every other week.

Often residents have difficulty keeping track of a schedule that is not so regular. Most of the routes (about 15 of 18) are done each month on the same relative day (second Wednesday, or third Thursday, etc.). Sometimes that will be a four week period, and sometimes five weeks. The three schedules that move more than that are the Monday schedules, that are designed to work around the majority of holidays and off days. To assist residents in keeping track of their sweeping day, we have informed them of their schedule, and keep an active list of all streets on the City Website so it can be checked at any time.

Field Services also takes any calls and assists callers in identifying the schedule for their street, whenever they forget and call us. Therefore, residents can mark a calendar for personal reference and easily keep track of when their street will be swept, so they can take appropriate action related to sweep day.

Complaints related to the removal of cars from the street on sweep day is an issue on certain streets and in certain neighborhoods regardless of the frequency of sweeping. Some residents forget, some don't care, and others try to "time" the sweeper and move their car just as the sweeper arrives and return to their parking place as the sweeper goes by. The largest complaints are against the residents who don't care, and are always parked on the street when the sweeper comes by. This is a different kind of enforcement issue, and is not corrected by increasing the sweeping frequency.

The greatest actual impact of less frequent sweeping comes during the leaf drop season. For most varieties of trees this is from November through January. Some varieties drop their leaves all year, but at a lower rate. Others may vary by a month in either direction. The alternatives presented are all aimed at increasing sweeping during this primary leaf drop time of year, but with different choices for the rest of the year.

This supplement considers three possible alternative schedule revisions, two that would increase the service and response level to requests or complaints, and one that would increase the level during the rainy season but would reduce it much further during the other months. All three alternatives include the purchase of a sweeping machine. Staff reviewed options for having a sweeper for a portion of the year such as sweeper rental, however the rental charges are greater than the cost of buying a sweeper for all options.

Alternative A would replace the eliminated Equipment Operator position as well as purchase a new sweeping machine. This will return the residential sweeping schedule to the previous level of once every two weeks. An additional 5,060 miles would be swept. This alternative would increase the requests/complaints response level to 95%.

Alternative B would allow for sweeping streets on a monthly basis during the summer and on a two-week schedule during the winter, when it is most needed. Besides the purchase of a sweeper, a seasonal operator would be hired during the winter. An additional 2,900 miles would be swept under this alternative. This alternative would increase the requests/ complaints response level to 85%.

Alternative C would allow for sweeping streets on a two-week schedule during the times of the year when there tends to be more litter and leaves (October through April), and responding to individual problems as necessary the rest of the year. As in Alternative B, a seasonal operator would be hired for six months, and a vacuum sweeper would be purchased. The current day sweeper driver would be reassigned to other tasks during the months when no sweeping

would be performed on a regular basis. This will not have a fiscal impact because the driver would fill temporary seasonal work required during the summer months in other activities within the Pavement Operations Program that is budgeted. During those months staff would respond to problems based on its assessment of need. Under this alternative, an additional 1,740 miles would be swept. However, because there would be no regular sweeping scheduled during half of the year, staff expects that the response level to requests/complaints would go down to 75%.

SERVICE LEVEL IMPACT

All of the alternatives will increase the total miles of streets swept. However, it is anticipated that Alternatives A and B would increase the performance measure target for "Street sweeping requests/complaints are responded to within 2 working days from notification - 80% of the time," while Alternative C would decrease it.

FISCAL IMPACT

Alternative A

This alternative would increase staff salaries by \$96,804 and additional costs (vehicles and rental rates) by \$219,000. The total budget increase for this alternative would be \$315,804. The 20 year fiscal impact is a cost increase of \$8,765,372 with inflation.

Alternative B

This alternative would increase staff salaries by \$41,448 and additional costs (vehicles and rental rates) by \$219,000. The total budget increase for this alternative would be \$260,448. The 20 year fiscal impact is a cost increase of \$7,228,926 with inflation.

Alternative C

This alternative would increase staff salaries by \$27,252 and additional costs (vehicles and rental rates) by \$219,000. The total budget increase for this alternative would be \$246,252. The 20 year fiscal impact is a cost increase of \$6,834,911 with inflation.

CONCLUSION

Street sweeping frequency was decreased for most residential neighborhoods from every other week to once per month due to the budget cut implemented in FY 2003/04. The City has received numerous (over 200 calls in two years)

requests to return to the higher service level schedule of every other week. This supplement considers three optional service level changes: A) Return to every other week for an additional \$315,804; B) Continue once per month in the summer, but increase to every other week in the winter for an additional \$260,448, or; C) Return to every other week during the winter, and eliminate scheduled summer sweeping in residential neighborhoods during the summer (as a cost-minimizing option) for an additional \$246,252.

Prepared by:

James Craig,
Superintendent of Field Services

Reviewed by:

Marvin A. Rose, Director
Department of Public Works

Reviewed by:

Mary J. Bradley
Director of Finance

City Manager's Recommendation

☐ Approve Budget Supplement for funding

☒ Do Not Approve Budget Supplement for funding

Amy Chan,
City Manager

Attachments

Attachment A – Budget Supplement Detail Form (Alternative A)

Attachment B – Budget Supplement Detail Form (Alternative B)

Attachment C – Budget Supplement Detail Form (Alternative C)

BUDGET SUPPLEMENT FORM
Fiscal Year 2006/2007

BUDGET SUPPLEMENT #6: RESTORATION OF STREET SWEEPING SERVICE LEVEL
ALTERNATIVE A

FISCAL IMPACT :	\$315,804
-----------------	-----------

TOTAL PROPOSED COSTS (Savings) :	\$315,804
TOTAL PROPOSED REVENUES :	\$0
NET IMPACT :	\$315,804

20-YEAR IMPACT :	\$8,765,372
------------------	-------------

DESCRIPTION OF THE TYPE OF RESOURCES AND THE PURPOSE FOR WHICH THEY ARE BEING REQUESTED:

This Budget Supplement will modify the frequency of street sweeping. This is one of three options presented.

CURRENT		PROPOSED	
PROGRAM 118 – PAVEMENT OPERATIONS			
STATEMENT		STATEMENT	
Maintain safe City roadways in a cost-effective and proactive manner to meet the community's current and future access needs...		One proposed change. Add: Sweeping streets on a regular, two-week schedule year around, and picking up leaves during heavy leaf drops throughout the City efficiently and thoroughly to keep streets clean and clear of debris and possible hazards.	
PROGRAM MEASURES			
MEASURE	TARGET	MEASURE	TARGET
Street sweeping requests/complaints are responded to within 2 working days from notification.	80%	Street sweeping requests/complaints are responded to within 2 working days from notification.	95%
SERVICE DELIVERY PLAN 118-05			
DESCRIPTION OF SERVICE DELIVERY PLAN		DESCRIPTION OF SERVICE DELIVERY PLAN	
Maintain clean and safe City travel ways and easements in a cost-effective and proactive manner to meet the community's current and future access needs...		No Proposed Change	

CURRENT				PROPOSED			
ACTIVITIES/PRODUCTS							
ACTIVITY #	DESCRIPTION	PRODUCT TYPE	PRODUCT	ACTIVITY #	DESCRIPTION	PRODUCT TYPE	PRODUCT
118510	Curb Sweeping of City Streets	A Mile Swept	9,900	118510	Curb Sweeping of City Streets	A Mile Swept	14,960
118530	Weekly Sweep of City-Owned Parking Lots	A Lot Swept	875	118530	Weekly Sweep of City-Owned Parking Lots	A Lot Swept	1,312
118550	Haul Street Sweepings and Other Debris	A Cubic Yard	5,500	118550	Haul Street Sweepings and Other Debris	A Cubic Yard	8,250
118860	Staff Training and Development	A Training Completed	130	118860	Staff Training and Development	A Training Completed	150
FISCAL IMPACT							
TOTAL SDP COSTS – CURRENT			\$378,416	TOTAL SDP COSTS – PROPOSED			\$694,220

ACTIVITY DETAIL
COST, HOURS AND PRODUCTS

SERVICE DELIVERY PLAN 118-05

PERSONNEL

ACTIVITY #	JOB CODE	CLASSIFICATION	WORK HOURS	PRODUCTS	COSTS
118510	5100	Equipment Operator	1,530	5,060	\$82,283
118520	5100	Equipment Operator	20	0	\$1,076
118530	5100	Equipment Operator	100	437	\$5,378
118540	5100	Equipment Operator	60	0	\$3,227
118550	5100	Equipment Operator	40	2,750	\$2,151
118860	5100	Equipment Operator	50	20	\$2,689
TOTALS			1,800	8,267	\$96,804

OTHER COSTS AND ADDITIONS

ACTIVITY #	OBJECT LEVEL	OBJECT NAME	COSTS
118980	5135	Vehicles & Motorized Equipment	\$165,000
118980	6503	Fleet Rental	\$54,000
TOTAL			\$219,000
GRAND TOTAL			\$315,804

BUDGET SUPPLEMENT FORM
Fiscal Year 2006/2007

BUDGET SUPPLEMENT #6: RESTORATION OF STREET SWEEPING SERVICE LEVEL
ALTERNATIVE B

FISCAL IMPACT :	\$260,448
-----------------	-----------

TOTAL PROPOSED COSTS (Savings) :	\$260,448
TOTAL PROPOSED REVENUES :	\$0
NET IMPACT :	\$260,448

20-YEAR IMPACT :	\$7,228,926
------------------	-------------

DESCRIPTION OF THE TYPE OF RESOURCES AND THE PURPOSE FOR WHICH THEY ARE BEING REQUESTED:

This Budget Supplement will modify the frequency of street sweeping. This is one of three options presented.

CURRENT	PROPOSED
PROGRAM 118 – PAVEMENT OPERATIONS	
STATEMENT	STATEMENT
Maintain safe City roadways in a cost-effective and proactive manner to meet the community's current and future access needs...	One proposed change. Add: Sweeping streets on a regular, two-week schedule year around, and picking up leaves during heavy leaf drops throughout the City efficiently and thoroughly to keep streets clean and clear of debris and possible hazards.
PROGRAM MEASURES	
MEASURE	MEASURE
Street sweeping requests/complaints are responded to within 2 working days from notification.	Street sweeping requests/complaints are responded to within 2 working days from notification.
TARGET	TARGET
80%	85%
SERVICE DELIVERY PLAN 118-05	
DESCRIPTION OF SERVICE DELIVERY PLAN	
Maintain clean and safe City travel ways and easements in a cost-effective and proactive manner to meet the community's current and future access needs...	No Proposed Change

ACTIVITIES/PRODUCTS							
CURRENT				PROPOSED			
ACTIVITY #	DESCRIPTION	PRODUCT TYPE	PRODUCT	ACTIVITY #	DESCRIPTION	PRODUCT TYPE	PRODUCT
118510	Curb Sweeping of City Streets	A Mile Swept	9,900	118510	Curb Sweeping of City Streets	A Mile Swept	12,800
FISCAL IMPACT							
TOTAL SDP COSTS – CURRENT			\$378,416	TOTAL SDP COSTS – PROPOSED			\$638,864

ACTIVITY DETAIL
COST, HOURS AND PRODUCTS

SERVICE DELIVERY PLAN 118-05

PERSONNEL

ACTIVITY #	JOB CODE	CLASSIFICATION	WORK HOURS	PRODUCTS	COSTS
118510	9993	Casual/Seasonal Equipment Operator	880	2,900	\$41,448
TOTALS			880	2,900	\$41,448

OTHER COSTS AND ADDITIONS

ACTIVITY #	OBJECT LEVEL	OBJECT NAME	COSTS
118980	5135	Vehicles & Motorized Equipment	\$165,000
118980	6503	Fleet Rental	\$54,000
TOTAL			\$219,000

GRAND TOTAL	\$260,448
-------------	-----------

BUDGET SUPPLEMENT FORM
Fiscal Year 2006/2007

BUDGET SUPPLEMENT #6: RESTORATION OF STREET SWEEPING SERVICE LEVEL
ALTERNATIVE C

FISCAL IMPACT :	\$246,252
-----------------	-----------

TOTAL PROPOSED COSTS (Savings) :	\$246,252
TOTAL PROPOSED REVENUES :	\$0
NET IMPACT :	\$246,252

20-YEAR IMPACT :	\$6,834,911
------------------	-------------

DESCRIPTION OF THE TYPE OF RESOURCES AND THE PURPOSE FOR WHICH THEY ARE BEING REQUESTED:

This Budget Supplement will modify the frequency of street sweeping. This is one of three options presented.

CURRENT	PROPOSED
PROGRAM 118 – PAVEMENT OPERATIONS	
STATEMENT	STATEMENT
Maintain safe City roadways in a cost-effective and proactive manner to meet the community's current and future access needs...	One proposed change. Add: Sweeping streets on a regular, two-week schedule year around, and picking up leaves during heavy leaf drops throughout the City efficiently and thoroughly to keep streets clean and clear of debris and possible hazards.
PROGRAM MEASURES	
MEASURE	MEASURE
Street sweeping requests/complaints are responded to within 2 working days from notification.	Street sweeping requests/complaints are responded to within 2 working days from notification.
TARGET	TARGET
80%	75%
SERVICE DELIVERY PLAN 118-05	
DESCRIPTION OF SERVICE DELIVERY PLAN	
Maintain clean and safe City travel ways and easements in a cost-effective and proactive manner to meet the community's current and future access needs...	No Proposed Change

CURRENT				PROPOSED			
ACTIVITIES/PRODUCTS							
ACTIVITY #	DESCRIPTION	PRODUCT TYPE	PRODUCT	ACTIVITY #	DESCRIPTION	PRODUCT TYPE	PRODUCT
118510	Curb Sweeping of City Streets	A Mile Swept	9,900	118510	Curb Sweeping of City Streets	A Mile Swept	11,640
FISCAL IMPACT							
TOTAL CURRENT COSTS			\$378,416	TOTAL PROPOSED COSTS			\$694,220

ACTIVITY DETAIL
COST, HOURS AND PRODUCTS

SERVICE DELIVERY PLAN 118-05

PERSONNEL

ACTIVITY #	JOB CODE	CLASSIFICATION	WORK HOURS	PRODUCTS	COSTS
118510	5100	Equipment Operator	(260)	0	(\$14,196)
118510	9993	Equipment Operator (seasonal)	880	1,740	\$41,148
TOTALS			620	1,740	\$27,252

PURCHASED GOODS AND SERVICES

ACTIVITY #	OBJECT LEVEL	OBJECT NAME	COSTS
118980	5135	Vehicles & Motorized Equipment	\$165,000
118980	6503	Fleet Rental	\$54,000
TOTAL			\$219,000

GRAND TOTAL	\$246,252
-------------	-----------

THIS PAGE NOT USED